

PILGRIM SATISFACTION AND THE EFFECTIVENESS OF RELIGIOUS TOURISM SERVICES: EVIDENCE FROM UMRAH OPERATIONS

Wahyu Ramadhan Harahap¹, Krisna², Elli Tri Hartati Harahap³,
Efrida Wardani Hutapea⁴, Mutiara Indah Siregar⁵, Ricka Handayani⁶

UIN Syekh Ali Hasan Ahmad Addary Padangsidempuan^{1,2,3,4,5,6}

E-mail : ramadhanwahyu957@gmail.com¹, 6451krisna@gmail.com²,
ellitrihartatiharahap@gmail.com³, efridawardani7@gmail.com⁴, mtrsir.03@gmail.com⁵,
Rickahandayani@uinsyahada.ac.id⁶

Abstract

This study aims to analyze how effective PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan provides the main services to increase the satisfaction of the pilgrims, as well as to describe the factors that support and hinder the services in the company. The method applied in this study is a descriptive qualitative method, with data collection techniques through interviews and observations, which aims to describe, display, and explain information related to service quality at PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan to increase pilgrim satisfaction. Researchers conducted interviews with several informants, including pilgrims and staff. The findings of this study indicate that the quality of service at PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan is quite good in various aspects. For example, this company has professional employees, provides adequate facilities, is responsible for each pilgrim from the registration process, the implementation of Umrah, to their arrival, and provides the right service, communicates smoothly, and is able to build trust among pilgrims. Supporting factors revealed from the interview include: a. Efficient management. b. Quite a strategic location. c. Good communication. d. Adequate facilities. The inhibiting factors include: a. Limited number of employees. The guides carry out their duties with patience and dedication, starting from the homeland to arriving in the holy land, so that the pilgrims feel satisfied with the services obtained.

Keyword: Effectiveness, Service System, Hajj and Umrah, Pilgrim Satisfaction

INTRODUCTION

Umrah is a form of Islamic ritual worship performed at any time of the year as an expression of fulfilling Allah's call by visiting the Holy Kaaba and carrying out specific religious rites. Unlike Hajj, which is restricted to certain months, Umrah can be performed year-round. However, some scholars consider performing Umrah on the Day of Arafah, Eid al-Adha, and the Days of Tashreeq to be makruh (discouraged) (Sarwat, 2019). Indonesia, being one of the countries with the largest Muslim population globally, sees a significant interest from its citizens in undertaking Umrah (Susilawati, 2016). The growing demand has led to the emergence of numerous Umrah travel agencies, resulting in intense competition. This often creates confusion among prospective pilgrims when selecting a travel agency that offers the best quality in services (Megawati, 2019).

In this competitive landscape, it is imperative for travel agencies to provide high-quality services and differentiate themselves from competitors. Service quality is closely linked to customer satisfaction (Susilawati, 2016). Proper service management is crucial to ensure a smooth pilgrimage experience and to meet the expectations of the pilgrims. These services span across several areas such as administration, transportation, accommodation, and organized religious guidance. Prior studies have shown that service effectiveness is influenced by multiple factors, including staff professionalism, adequate facilities, and the application of technology like the Integrated Hajj and Umrah Computer System (SISKOHAT), which enhances transparency and real-time data access.

Moreover, Islamic communication during the pilgrimage plays a vital role in reinforcing the faith and spirituality of pilgrims. The quality of interaction between religious guides and pilgrims is a significant indicator of service satisfaction. A competent guide is expected to possess in-depth knowledge of Islamic jurisprudence (fiqh), strong communication skills, and the ability to address both the emotional and spiritual needs of the pilgrims.

PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Tour and Travel, established in 1996 and officially licensed to conduct Umrah trips since July 20, 2016, operates under legal recognition by the Ministry of Law and Human Rights, Ministry of Finance, and Ministry of Religious Affairs. This agency

initially served only as a departure facilitator but has since evolved to offer comprehensive Umrah travel services. From 2016 onwards, PT Multazam began to experience significant growth in the number of pilgrims. In 2019 (1440 H), the agency successfully facilitated monthly Umrah trips for nine months, from October to June, including Ramadan. They operated between one to three group departures per month (up to four in Ramadan), with each group comprising 25–45 people. In total, over 2000 pilgrims were sent in 2019, with 200 during Ramadan alone, marking the highest number among local agencies.

The agency's primary strength lies in its administrative support. For example, upon visiting the office for passport arrangements, pilgrims are assisted by dedicated staff throughout the process, including documentation, photography, and verification. Furthermore, pilgrims receive a briefing from the company's director about the upcoming religious journey (Interview, May 19, 2025).

Manasik (ritual rehearsal) sessions are conducted with a warm welcome and attentive support from staff. Facilities provided include a fully equipped prayer area and a hall for practical training. These sessions are led by the company's leadership, who provide detailed guidance on the essential rituals of Umrah. Prior to departure, a practical simulation of Tawaf and Sa'i is conducted using miniatures of the Kaaba and Hijr Ismail, and pilgrims are also trained in wearing the Ihram garments (Interview, November 19, 2025).

This study seeks to evaluate the effectiveness of Umrah service systems in enhancing pilgrim satisfaction, focusing on service management, the role of digitalization, and religious communication. Previous research has explored various dimensions of Umrah services but often in isolation or with limited empirical evidence. There remains a research gap in comprehensively linking service quality, technological integration, and religious mentorship to customer satisfaction within the context of a single agency in Indonesia.

This research is therefore both significant and urgent. It addresses a pressing need to understand how service design influences the spiritual and logistical aspects of Umrah, especially for agencies serving high numbers of pilgrims. The study contributes to filling the knowledge gap

by providing practical and theoretical insights into service quality in religious tourism. Furthermore, it offers innovative perspectives by integrating digital tools, religious pedagogy, and service performance into a single evaluative framework. The novelty of this research lies in its holistic examination of a local agency's service system that has not been thoroughly investigated in earlier national or international studies. Through this approach, the research aims to generate new knowledge and potentially reshape existing practices in Umrah service delivery.

METHOD

This study adopts a qualitative descriptive approach to explore the effectiveness of Umrah service management in enhancing pilgrim satisfaction at PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Tour and Travel. The qualitative method allows for an in-depth understanding of service delivery, focusing on administrative support, the application of digital technologies, and religious communication. Data collection involved several techniques, including in-depth interviews, participant observation, and document analysis. Interviews were conducted with key informants such as agency directors, operational staff, religious mentors (muthowif), and pilgrims who had previously joined Umrah trips. Observations were carried out during manasik sessions and administrative activities to gain real-time insights into how services are provided. Supporting documents—such as internal reports, schedules, and promotional materials—were also examined to enrich and validate the primary findings.

Informants in this study were selected through purposive sampling, ensuring that each participant met specific criteria relevant to the research focus. These informants were individuals with direct experience in the planning, implementation, or use of Umrah services. The study utilized both primary and secondary data. Primary data came from direct interviews and observations, while secondary data were obtained from organizational documents, literature reviews, and government policies related to Umrah services. The collected data were analyzed using Miles and Huberman's interactive model, which includes three steps: data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing with verification. This method provided a structured process for

organizing complex qualitative data, identifying patterns, and drawing meaningful conclusions regarding the effectiveness of the agency's service system.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Evaluation of Umrah Service Quality and Its Impact on Pilgrim Satisfaction

The evaluation of Umrah services focuses on the quality of services provided to pilgrims and how these services affect their overall satisfaction. This assessment includes examining the effectiveness of information dissemination to prospective pilgrims, the efficiency of service delivery, and the adequacy of resources such as human capital and technological infrastructure. The study emphasizes the importance of real-time online systems that enhance the management and tracking of Umrah processes, thereby improving the overall pilgrimage experience. Additionally, it identifies challenges such as the need for better internet connectivity and the importance of community engagement through outreach efforts involving religious leaders to ensure accurate information reaches prospective pilgrims. By addressing these challenges, the evaluation aims to propose actionable recommendations that can lead to improved service quality and increased satisfaction among pilgrims, ultimately contributing to a more meaningful and fulfilling spiritual journey for those undertaking this sacred ritual.

The quality of services provided by PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan during Umrah plays a crucial role in determining the level of pilgrim satisfaction. Key factors influencing this satisfaction include the professionalism of the staff, the availability of necessary facilities, and the overall management of the pilgrimage experience. For instance, having well-trained employees who can efficiently cater to pilgrims' needs significantly enhances their comfort and trust in the service provider. Additionally, the provision of essential materials, such as prayer guides and equipment, enriches the worship experience, making it more organized and spiritually satisfying. Strategic service management—which encompasses planning, implementation, and evaluation—is vital in meeting pilgrims' expectations. Moreover, the ability to respond promptly to inquiries and concerns, while ensuring safety and comfort, fosters a positive environment for worshippers,

ultimately leading to higher satisfaction. In a competitive landscape with many service providers, maintaining high service standards is essential for attracting and retaining pilgrims, as it directly impacts their overall experience and perception of the pilgrimage.

The effectiveness of services offered by PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan is vital in understanding how service quality influences pilgrim satisfaction. High-quality services—including well-maintained facilities, efficient transportation, and attentive staff—are critical in enhancing the overall pilgrimage experience. The physical aspects of service quality, such as accommodation conditions and staff professionalism, significantly shape how pilgrims perceive their journey. Furthermore, service providers must prioritize continuous improvement by actively seeking feedback from past pilgrims to adapt and meet evolving client expectations. This commitment to quality not only fosters a positive experience but also builds trust and loyalty among worshippers, encouraging them to return for future pilgrimages. Understanding the gap between pilgrims' expectations and the actual services received is essential, as this discrepancy can significantly affect their overall satisfaction. Therefore, a thorough evaluation of service quality and facilities is necessary to ensure that pilgrims have a satisfying and spiritually enriching journey.

Evaluating the quality of Umrah services is essential to understand its impact on pilgrim satisfaction. The services provided by travel agencies play a critical role in ensuring that pilgrims have a positive experience throughout their religious journey. Effective service delivery encompasses various aspects, such as providing guidance for rituals, ensuring comfortable accommodations, and offering reliable transportation and healthcare services. The role of the tour leader is particularly important, as they manage the journey and address any issues that may arise, directly influencing the pilgrims' satisfaction. Research indicates that tour leaders' services can effectively meet pilgrims' needs, making them feel safe, comfortable, and happy during their journey. As the demand for Umrah increases, especially among lower-income groups due to limited Hajj quotas, service quality becomes even more vital in meeting the expectations of pilgrims.

Service and Umrah quality play a key role in determining the satisfaction level of pilgrims, as they directly affect their overall experience during this significant religious journey. Effective marketing strategies, including clear visions and missions, are essential for travel services to attract and retain clients. By conducting a thorough analysis of internal and external environments—including SWOT analysis—organizations can better understand their strengths and weaknesses, enabling them to tailor their offerings to meet the specific needs of worshippers. Additionally, implementing a strong marketing mix can enhance service delivery, ensuring that pilgrims receive the necessary support and guidance throughout their pilgrimage. Evaluating these services is equally important, as it involves assessing the effectiveness of communication strategies and information sources available to prospective worshippers. This evaluation process helps identify areas for improvement, ensuring that the services provided align with pilgrims' expectations. Ultimately, a commitment to high-quality service—grounded in principles of professionalism and trust—can significantly enrich the worship experience, leading to greater satisfaction and a deeper spiritual journey for those participating in Umrah. This research aims to identify aspects that require improvement, such as accommodation, transportation, ritual guidance, and healthcare services. By understanding the factors that influence pilgrim satisfaction, Umrah organizers can implement continuous improvements, allowing pilgrims to perform their worship in a more focused and comfortable manner.

Forms of Services Provided by PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan

Having professional staff is one of the company's key responsibilities in delivering satisfactory services. As stated by Hj. Alya Rahmayani Siregar, S.Ag., S.Pd.I., one of the Umrah participants from the village of Sei Sikambing, "I am very satisfied with the services at PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan. The process is simple and fast. The leadership is calm, the employees are kind and friendly." Based on this interview, the comfort of the pilgrims largely depends on the quality of service provided by the staff. Employees of PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan are expected to be courteous, respectful, well-mannered, and personable. In addition, staff

should be responsive, pleasant, intelligent, and capable of winning the pilgrims' trust and interest. Their work must also be neat, fast, and efficient.

Every leader and staff member at the company is expected to take full responsibility for the pilgrims, both while they are still in Indonesia and after they arrive in the Holy Land. As expressed by Elda Repelita Nasution, S.Sos., another participant from Tanjung Balai, "The service provided was very satisfying, from mental preparation to other logistical aspects." Upon arrival in the Holy Land, Dr. H. Syafi'i Siregar, Lc., M.A. added, "The Umrah guide was very attentive to the pilgrims." This means that throughout all service activities, PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan is required to provide end-to-end service. Pilgrims will feel satisfied when staff members are responsible and meet their expectations throughout the entire journey.

This refers to the obligation of PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan's staff to deliver services to pilgrims according to established procedures. Services must be provided in a timely manner for specific tasks, avoiding errors that could lead to services falling short of company standards or pilgrims' expectations. Accurate service delivery reflects adherence to organizational norms and contributes to overall customer satisfaction.

The trust of prospective pilgrims in PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan is essential for them to choose the company for their pilgrimage. Likewise, in order to retain existing pilgrims, maintaining their trust is equally important. Confidence in the company ensures loyalty and strengthens the relationship between the service provider and the worshippers.

The Role of Government Policy in Enhancing Umrah Pilgrims' Satisfaction

Government policies play a vital role in improving the quality of Umrah services. Through the implementation of structured policies aligned with the needs of pilgrims, the government can establish a service system that is efficient, transparent, and focused on customer satisfaction. One of the key implementations of these policies is the management of services through the Integrated Information and Computerized System (SISKOHAT), which streamlines administrative processes such as registration, payment, document archiving, and monitoring of

pilgrims' departure and return. The government also provides services addressing various pilgrim needs, such as registration, pilgrimage cancellation, partial number allocation, mahram integration, elderly assistance, and more. Each process is supported by clearly defined Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) in accordance with the legal regulations of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. Consistent enforcement of these SOPs ensures orderly and reliable service delivery.

Services are delivered professionally, promptly, and accurately, allowing pilgrims to experience comfort and trust in the Umrah service process. Furthermore, government policies support the provision of adequate facilities and infrastructure, from registration offices and information systems to support teams in the Holy Land. A responsive and courteous approach by service personnel reflects the government's genuine commitment to providing optimal service. These staff members are trained to deliver services attentively, politely, and warmly, making pilgrims feel respected and supported throughout their worship journey. Through such policies, the government demonstrates its dedication to providing services that are not only administratively efficient but also empathetic and human-centered. As a result, the level of pilgrim satisfaction continues to increase, highlighting the government's success in managing and optimizing the complex process of Umrah service delivery.

Government policies also have a strategic role in fostering Umrah pilgrim satisfaction, particularly through price regulation and service quality improvement. Relevant policies include tariff regulation, monitoring of Umrah travel providers, and support for infrastructure and technology that enhance service delivery. Setting fair and competitive prices in line with minimum service standards helps balance the needs of pilgrims with the sustainability of Umrah travel businesses.

In the context of pricing, the government ensures transparency and fairness through appropriate regulations. These regulations may involve setting maximum or minimum price limits to prevent pricing practices that could disadvantage pilgrims. For example, strategies such as geographical pricing—based on the pilgrim's location—or promotional pricing to boost interest are implemented within government-issued guidelines to ensure they remain reasonable. Such

policies also ensure that prices correspond to the promised quality of service, so that pilgrims receive a fulfilling and well-supported worship experience.

The Strategic Role of Service Quality and Government Regulation in Pilgrim Experience Management

The effectiveness of Umrah service delivery is not only a matter of operational efficiency but is deeply rooted in how service quality aligns with the emotional, spiritual, and practical expectations of the pilgrims. From the data and observations gathered in this study, it is evident that PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan has strategically positioned itself as a service provider that emphasizes personalized attention, staff competence, and end-to-end responsibility. These factors significantly influence pilgrim satisfaction and establish a level of trust that sustains customer loyalty in a highly competitive market.

From a service management perspective, competent staff serve as the front line of religious tourism. Their demeanor, communication style, and problem-solving capabilities become critical touchpoints in shaping the overall experience of the pilgrims. The ability of the staff to remain professional, responsive, and emotionally supportive reflects not just training outcomes but also the organizational culture cultivated by PT. Multazam Wisata Agung. This observation reinforces findings from previous studies (e.g., Susilawati, 2016; Megawati, 2019) that emphasize the human element as a core determinant of satisfaction in religious travel services.

Furthermore, the company's ability to maintain responsibility throughout the pilgrim's journey—from pre-departure arrangements to post-arrival support in the Holy Land—reveals a high level of service integration. This approach addresses one of the most frequently cited concerns among Umrah participants: lack of continuity and accountability across stages of service. By bridging this service gap, PT. Multazam Wisata Agung not only ensures consistency but also nurtures a sense of security and assurance among pilgrims, many of whom may be first-time travelers engaging in a deeply spiritual undertaking.

When viewed through the lens of policy influence, government interventions play a complementary yet critical role. Structured frameworks such as SISKOHAT not only streamline administrative processes but also foster transparency and reduce the risk of mismanagement or fraud—factors that have historically undermined the reputation of some travel providers. The government's establishment of clear SOPs and pricing regulations also acts as a safeguard for consumer rights, especially in a market where spiritual aspiration can be easily exploited for profit.

However, the real impact of these government policies is realized only when they are enforced consistently and supported by effective infrastructure. While the policies exist, variations in implementation quality across different regions and providers can dilute their intended benefits. This indicates a potential gap between policy formulation and operational realities on the ground—a research gap that future studies should further investigate.

What is particularly noteworthy is the alignment between public policy and private initiative in this case. PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan demonstrates how a private entity can operationalize public frameworks not merely as regulatory obligations but as tools to enhance service quality. This synergy, when replicated across the industry, could significantly uplift the standard of Umrah services nationally.

In conclusion, the discussion highlights the interconnectedness between internal service strategies and external regulatory support. The strength of PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan lies in its responsiveness to both—its ability to manage human resources effectively while aligning its operations with government expectations. This dual commitment is what ultimately drives the high level of satisfaction reported by pilgrims and suggests a sustainable model for other Umrah service providers to emulate.

CONCLUSION

This study reveals that the quality of Umrah service management, combined with effective government policies, plays a crucial role in enhancing pilgrim satisfaction. Key findings highlight that competent and responsible staff, accurate service delivery, and trustworthy

communication significantly improve the overall experience of pilgrims. Furthermore, the implementation of integrated administrative systems and clear operational procedures ensures efficiency and transparency, fostering confidence among the pilgrims throughout their spiritual journey.

From an academic perspective, this research contributes to the existing body of knowledge by bridging the gap between service management practices and public policy in the context of religious tourism. It provides a novel insight into how digitalization and human-centered service approaches can synergize with governmental regulation to optimize service quality. This study offers a comprehensive model that can be used as a reference for other pilgrimage-related service providers and policymakers aiming to enhance customer satisfaction in complex service environments.

Despite these contributions, this research has some limitations. The study primarily focuses on one travel agency and a specific cultural context, which may affect the generalizability of the findings. Future research should incorporate a broader range of service providers and explore the perspectives of pilgrims from diverse backgrounds. Additionally, longitudinal studies could be valuable to assess how ongoing policy changes and technological advancements continuously impact pilgrim satisfaction over time.

REFERENCES

- Aang Ridwan, Ariq Ramlan, and Fauzidan Fauzidan, (2022) ‘Komunikasi Dan Penyiaran Islam Dalam Perjalanan Haji Dan Umrah’, *Mabrur: Academic Journal of Hajj and Umra*, 1.1, pp
- Ahmad Rofi Usmani, *Pesona Ibadah Haji*, (Bandung : PT Mixan Pustaka, 2015)
- Badan Pusat Statistik (BPS), (2023) *Statistik Komunikasi dan Informatika Indonesia*. Jakarta: BPS.
- Departemen Pendidikan Nasional, (2019) *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Pusat Bahasa*, Balai Pustaka, Jakarta.
- Dimas Assyakurrohim and others, (2022). ‘Case Study Method in Qualitative Research’, *Jurnal Pendidikan Sains Dan Komputer*, 3.01
- Effendi, S., & Suryadi, K., (2021) Pengaruh Kualitas Pelayanan Terhadap Kepuasan Jamaah Umrah di PT. XYZ Travel. *Jurnal Pariwisata Syariah*, 4(1),
- Fahmi Gunawan, *Senarai Penelitian Pendidikan, Hukum, Dan Ekonomi* , Di Sulawesi Tenggara, Yogyakarta: CV Budi Utama, 2018.
- Hafida Firdaus, Abd Aziz, and Abd Ghafur, (2023), ‘Efektifitas Sistem Pelayanan Haji Umroh Dalam Meningkatkan Kepuasan Jamaah Di PT. Multazam Wisata Agung Medan Layanan Utama Probolinggo’, *ILTIZAM Journal of Shariah Economics Research*, 7.1
- Ikhlas Jauhari, Nurul Umi Ati, and Retno Wulan Sekarsari, ‘Evaluasi Pusat Layanan Haji Dan Umrah Terpadu Di Kementerian Agama Kabupaten Malang’, *Jurnal Respon Publik*, 18.2 (2024), pp. 8–17.
- Jamaah Umrah Pada PT Al Hijaz Tahun 2019’, *MULTAZAM: Jurnal Manajemen Haji Dan Umrah*, Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia. *Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 8 Tahun 2022 tentang Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Haji dan Umrah*. Jakarta: Kementerian Agama, 2022., hlm. 1-5
- Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia. (2022). *Peraturan Menteri Agama Nomor 8 Tahun 2022 tentang Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Haji dan Umrah*. Jakarta: Kementerian Agama, 2022., hlm. 7-15
- Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia. (2024). *Panduan Manasik Umrah*. Jakarta: Ditjen Penyelenggaraan Haji dan Umrah, 2024., hlm. 5
- Kotler, P., & Keller, K. L. (A Framework for Marketing Management (7th ed.). Pearson Education. 2021., hlm. 175-180
- Masyhuri, N. Dinamika Kebijakan Penyelenggaraan Ibadah Haji dan Umroh di Indonesia. *Jurnal Hukum Islam*, 2017., hlm. 1-20.
- Mega Utami Maharani and others, ‘Strategi Pemasaran Biro Perjalanan Haji Umroh Dalam Meningkatkan Minat Calon Jemaah’, *Mabrur: Academic Journal of Hajj and Umra*, 1.1 (2022), pp. 85–106
- Mia Lasmi Wardiah, *Teori Perilaku dan Budaya Organisasi*, Pusaka Setia, Bandung, 2016, hlm. 244.
- Moenir, A. S. (2005). *Manajemen Pelayanan Umum di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 2005., hlm. 16

- Natsir, M., & Sari, D. P., Kualitas Pelayanan Haji dan Umroh: Tinjauan dari Dimensi Tangibles, Reliability, Responsiveness, Assurance, dan Empathy. *Jurnal Manajemen Bisnis Syariah*, 2020., 5(2), 150-165.
- Pendidikan Sains Dan Komputer*, 3.01 (2022), pp. 1–9
- Pusat Bahasa Departemen Pendidikan Nasional. Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia. Jakarta : Balai Pustaka, 2008., hlm. 828
- Sheila Novila and Abdul Mujib, ‘Manajemen Strategi Pelayanan Prima PT. Dago Wisata Internasional dalam Meningkatkan Kepuasan Jemaah Haji Dan Umrah’, *Mabrur: Academic Journal of Hajj and Umra*, 1.2 (2023), pp. 137–54
- Siti Raudatul Firdausiyah and Erin Nur Putriani, ‘Optimalisasi Pelayanan Administrasi Dalam Meningkatkan Kepuasan Calon Jemaah Haji (Studi Penyelenggara Haji Dan Umrah Kementerian Agama Kabupaten Probolinggo)’, *Innovative: Journal Of Social Science Research*, 4.3 (2024), pp. 13556–73
- Sumarwan, U. (2019). *Perilaku Konsumen: Teori dan Penerapannya dalam Pemasaran (Edisi 3)*. Bogor: Ghalia Indonesia, 2019., hlm. 230-235
- Wulandari and Kartika Utami, ‘Evaluasi Pelayanan Tour Leader PT Al Hijaz Terhadap